



Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) of Budget Proposals

2016

Name of Budget Saving	Re-introduce charging for instrumental tuition
Department and service area	Education
Completion Date	10/10/16
Lead officer	Grace Vickers

Aims and Objectives

Re-introduce charging for instrumental tuition

1. Does the proposed budget saving affect people?

Yes

☒

No

☐

2. What is/are the reason(s) for your proposed budget saving?

The reintroduction of charges for instrumental tuition will reduce the cost of providing the service to pupils in Midlothian, thereby avoiding/reducing the potential need for reductions in the level of service provided. The proposal is to reinstate charges at the level levied in 2014/15.

3. Impact

Which of the protected characteristics* will the proposed budget saving have an impact upon?

Equality Target Group*	Positive Impact	Negative Impact	Relevant evidence/information
Age	Experience in Midlothian in 2010/11 showed that redundancies had a greater impact upon the uptake of tuition than the introduction of charges the following year. The potential for redundancies if savings are not made therefore has a greater impact upon the availability of instrumental tuition and the uptake by pupils, particularly those from more disadvantaged backgrounds who are not able to opt instead for private tuition.	10% of pupils attending Midlothian schools take up instrumental tuition, and a smaller subset who do not qualify for assistance will be unable to pay and will not be able to receive tuition. The reinstatement of the Free School Meals (FSM)/Clothing Grants (CG) relief from charges, along with the bursary scheme, will offset the effect of reintroducing charges upon children from more disadvantaged backgrounds.	Applies to pupils only, although not reinstating fees could lead to a reduction in staff.
Disability			The fees will apply irrespective of disability. At this time there is no data available on uptake rates by pupils with a disability.
Gender			The fees will apply irrespective of gender

Reassignment			reassignment. At this time there is no data available on uptake rates by pupils from this group.
Marriage & Civil Partnership			N/a
Pregnancy and maternity			N/a
Race			The fees will apply irrespective of race. At this time there is no data available on uptake rates by race.
Religion or Belief			The fees will apply irrespective of religion or belief. At this time there is no data available on uptake rates by religion or belief.
Sex			The fees will apply irrespective of gender. At this time there is no data available on uptake rates by gender.
Sexual Orientation			The fees will apply irrespective of sexual orientation. At this time there is no data available on uptake rates by sexual orientation.

4. How will the implementation of the proposed budget saving be communicated to those affected by any changes?

Communication type to be decided but it will be ensured that alternative formats are available as requested.

5. How will you monitor the impact of the changes proposed? When is the budget due to be reviewed?

Continue to monitor overall uptake levels of pupils and the proportion of pupils having their fees waived by qualifying for FSM, CG or bursary, and increase promotion of these if necessary.

6. Please use the space below to detail any other matters arising from the Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) process.

Midlothian introduced charges in 2011/12 but waived them for children in receipt of free school meals (FSM)/clothing grant (CG) and those on a low income (<£10,000 above FSM limit) could apply for 100 bursaries. From 2013/14 free tuition was put in place for pupils sitting SQA music on one instrument. From 2015/16 the fee charges were halved, then removed from 2016/17. In 2013/14 46 bursaries were awarded.

The Improvement Service publishes an annual report on Instrumental Music Services.

They note: "Plenty of anecdotal evidence suggests that instrumental tuition has a positive effect in wider disciplines of education and learning. Renfrewshire's instrumental service carried out a survey among parents and 85% agreed that instrumental tuition provides further benefits in education; overall parents had a very positive response and appreciated the service. In Midlothian, head 29 teachers have indicated improvement of classes after beginning music projects."

The 2015 report found that 24 out of 32 local authorities charged, with the average charge of £184 per pupil per year for group tuition, including instrument hire.

In Midlothian pupil numbers dropped following staff redundancies, then again following the introduction of charges:

2009/10 1500

2010/11 1300 – year after redundancies

2011/12 1140 – year after charges

2012/13 1100 9.4%

2013/14 1100 9.4%

2014/15 1221 10.2%

In 2014/15 (the last year full fees were charged) 12% of those taking up tuition received FSM/CG, compared to 17% of the overall pupil population who are entitled to FSM/CG.

The 2015 Improvement Service review found “Similar to 2012/13 and 2013/14, there is no statistically significant correlation between the variation of tuition fees and the percentage of pupils who took instrumental music tuition across local authorities in Scotland in 2014/15. This is also the case when results are split into sub-groups of charging and non-charging local authorities. In other words, Instrumental Music Services with relatively high tuition fees did not necessarily have a lower percentage of pupils that took Instrumental Music in 2014/15 than local authorities with relatively low or no tuition fees.”

“This analysis also does not demonstrate whether there are variations in pupil numbers from different areas or socio-economic backgrounds within local authorities.”

The review also found that “All instrumental music services are heavily subsidised by Local Government”: at the time the income in Midlothian totalled £120k, 18% of the estimated cost of providing the service.

The 2013 report notes “The impact of introducing or increasing charges has different results in different Local Authorities. Midlothian and South Lanarkshire Councils both introduced charges in 2011/12 and subsequently experienced a drop in pupil numbers. Midlothian’s instrumental pupil numbers fell by approximately 12% from the previous year, however the service was expecting a considerably larger decrease. The service experienced a greater drop in pupil numbers when they implemented staff cuts a year beforehand (13.3%).”

20.1% of children attending the 5 schools with the highest FSM rates in Midlothian took music tuition, much higher than the 9.5% average across the county.

In Midlothian introducing charges led to parents/carers becoming more involved in the service: they took a larger interest in music instruction and were very supportive of the regional ensembles. Very low drop-out rates were found when charges in place, at only 1-3%.

The reinstatement of the FSM/CG relief from charges, along with the bursary scheme,

will offset the effect of reintroducing charges upon children from more disadvantaged backgrounds.

Please send an electronic copy of completed forms to lesley.crozier@midlothian.gov.uk