

APPENDIX C

Name of CTB making the asset transfer request:	Bonnyrigg Rose Community Football Club SCIO (BRCFC)
Land to which this asset transfer request relate:	Poltonhall Sports Complex Site
Validation date:	28/09/22
Initial assessment - 23.11.22:	Community Management Assessment Group Panel
Follow up assessment 15.05.23:	Community Management Assessment Group Panel
Follow up assessment 29.06.23:	Community Management Assessment Group Panel

Projects Objectives	Evidence	Assessment Score 1-5 (1-Weak, 5-Very Strong)
<p>Do the project objectives meet the Single Midlothian Plan objectives?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduce the economic circumstances gap • Reduce the gap in learning outcomes • Reduce the gap in health outcomes • Reduce carbon emissions in Midlothian to net zero by 2030 	<p>The application shows clear evidence that through the delivery of a range of activities and programmes, BRCFC have made contributions to the gap in learning and health outcomes.</p> <p>The club's activities provide paid work for local people and the application demonstrates that there is a wider community reach through activities that promote positive mental health, work with a range of age groups and helps to reduce social isolation.</p> <p>During the pandemic the club secured funding and provided support to people who were experiencing difficulties through this time; and are a Trusted Partner for the Council's Cost of Living support programme.</p> <p>Environmentally, the club have delivered LED replacement lighting and by keeping coaching local this potentially reduces</p>	<p>Overall 4</p>

	travel/carbon emissions for travelling out with the area.	
<p>Value to relevant authority in existing use of asset?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feasibility and cost of relocation of services elsewhere • Potential revenue savings arising from transfer 	<p>The Council instructed an independent surveyor in April 2023 to carry out a survey of the requested site. The surveyors have advised that the value of the site to the Council is as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If the site was to be sold on the open market it could achieve - flat £40,000, pavilion £85,000, pitches £85,000 capital - total £210,000. • If the site was to be rented at market value it could achieve (per annum): flat £7,500, pavilion £8,300, pitches £23,200 – total £39,000. <p>It should be noted that with regards to the care taker's flat the sale and rental value is for commercial use only and not for residential accommodation.</p> <p>Condition of the site and cost to the Council to bring to sale/rental standard:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Care taker's flat was inspected in May 2023, and it is estimated that there would require an investment of circa £74k to bring the property up to a standard that would enable the flat to be rented out on a commercial basis (to then achieve £7.5k/annum). The sale value of £40k is based on as seen condition. • No investment costs required to sell/lease the pitches, pavilion or car park. • Note the significant investment in 2021/22 to the pitches funded from Developer Contributions (£582), Sports Scotland funding (£100k) and Bonnyrigg Rose (£50k) - totals £732k. • Note the investment from BRCFC in the pavilion which has been in lieu of rental as the club took the pavilion as seen in 2017. This amounts to circa £93k and includes 	<p>(if high value to Council score 0, no or little value 5)</p> <p>Overall 4</p>

	<p>electrical, plumbing, painting work as well as investment to upgrade the facility for the users i.e. kitchen refit, double glazing installation, CCTV and wifi installation etc.</p> <p>If the Council was to maintain ownership then there would be ongoing maintenance costs for the site which would be in the region of £18-£25k/annum, plus £1k-£5k/annum for tree and hedge maintenance plus liability for any reactive repairs that are not covered within lease arrangements, if tenanted.</p> <p>There are other pitches within Midlothian however there are none that the club would be able to take over the lease of and they would require to share facilities with another club. The application demonstrates the use of the facility, significant membership numbers and that the club has established this usage over a period of time that would make it challenging to relocate elsewhere. The club have also invested volunteer time and their own funding to improve the facilities and purchased plant/machinery to maintain and upkeep the pitches.</p>	
Value for alternative use/redevelopment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fields in Trust (FiT) site – a transfer would be subject to agreement from FiT. • Not in Strategic Housing Investment Plan • The flat is not on the housing account therefore no current maintenance takes place • Could be run by a different operator – see information above on the value of sale/rental 	<p>(if high value to Council score 0, no or little value 5)</p> <p>Overall 4</p>
Value for proposed and other community benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In addition to the football offer the community side of the club works with all age groups, supports the reduction of social isolation, provides mental health support through free counselling sessions that they secured funding for, host and support ASN football sessions, support employability and work with the community payback team • Affordable and accessible space (space is at a premium in Bonnyrigg) 	<p>Overall 4</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Value of volunteers UEFA model – using social return on investment model – substantial. The SROI report from Jan 2022 assesses that the total current impact of participation amounts to €3.95m split over economic impact of social benefits (€2.252m), direct contributions to the economy (€475.264k) and health (€1.224m) 	
Level of community benefits <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extent of community served Nature of benefits to be delivered Community need/demand for the services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extensive reach within the local community Waiting lists are in operation 650 children receiving 5 hours exercise per week 	Overall 4
Likelihood that benefits will be delivered over a 5 year period <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strength of organisation Sustainability of business plan/project Sources and level of funding support 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Commercial opportunities for planned growth £35k sinking fund per annum proposed and monies have been ring-fenced by the club into a separate bank account, at June 2023 the club had saved £100,000 with a standing order of £3,000 per month in place Has made reference to external funders Business plan is very community focussed but limited evidence of revenue streams Accounts demonstrate £90k went into upgrading facilities last year Growth and sustainability - in terms of growth the club has not increased fees in 5 years and is working hard not to increase fees to help its members at this current time. The club has waiting lists across all age groups and see club membership increasing by 7% per year for the next 5 years without any increase in fees netting £16k per annum. There is also the nearby housebuilding which is anticipated to add to club membership if the capacity is there to do so. 	Overall 3
Impact of project failure <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To surrounding local environment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No obligation on the council to take back the asset Club has provided annual statement evidencing sinking funds 	If the impact of project failure is high, it scores 0.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To reputation of the parties To the service users'/relevant authority's objectives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Risk – the council has no money to replace the astro There is a Community expectation that the facility will be available and maintained. 	Overall 2
7 Best Value themes	Evidence	Score 1-5 (1-Weak, 5-Very Strong)
Vision and Leadership – does the organisation have in place a clear vision and plan for what it will do to contribute to the delivery of improved outcomes for Scotland?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved outcomes - to offer a quality facility for all to access and support the needs of our local community Linked to Single Midlothian Plan and track record of delivery Could have been clearer evidence in a business plan (strategic link etc) 	Overall 4
Effective Partnerships – does the organisation have a collaborative approach to the challenges that communities face?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed list of partners and evidence of delivery but could have provided more coherent detail on other partners and what they actually do with them 	Overall 4
Governance and Accountability – can the organisation demonstrate structure, policies and leadership behaviours?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Established as a SCIO Constitution has been checked Policies are in place Proven record of delivering projects Securing external funding and demonstrating appropriate delivery of funding 	Overall 4
Use of resources – how does the organisation demonstrate effective management of all resources to deliver on outcomes?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Online booking system Gift aid collection Have demonstrated effective management of the facilities to date Invested in the pavilion and additional space via the log cabin Maximises use of external and alternative funding sources to deliver programmes 122 registered volunteers 	Overall 4
Performance management – does the organisation have robust arrangements in place to monitor and report on outcomes?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> UEFA - Social return on investment report (attached) Have demonstrated they can secure external funding and council grant funding monitoring is up to date 	Overall 3

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information from the business plan demonstrates the Club's governance meetings and it meets regularly to report on progress and performance against the different activities it delivers. • The club receives a range of external funding awards as described within the business plan and each of those funding bodies also requires performance reporting from the Club • The club is required to report annually to OSCR with regards activity delivery and outcomes • The club reports annually to the SFA on outcomes achieved and has submitted a letter of support from the SFA (attached) 	
Sustainability – what is the organisation doing to contribute to sustainable development?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LED Light bulbs • Renewables • Tree planting • Replaced all external windows • Limited opportunities for external improvements • Looking to change the heating system as the club's next capital project to improve energy use and reduce carbon footprint 	Overall 4
Equality – has the organisation taken consideration of an embedded equality issues into its strategy?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doesn't make specific reference to a strategy however, have provided Code of Conduct, equity statement and associated documents which outline the club's approach to equalities. Recommended that these be updated at some point in terms of good practice • Currently projects are working with girls, older people, communities that are experiencing poverty, deliver projects that promote positive mental health and work with disability groups. Most but not all equalities groups are evidenced in the application. 	Overall 4
TOTAL		52/70

		74% positive
--	--	---------------------

Recommendations:	It is recommended that the asset transfer request be granted subject to conditions.
Conditions:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of the sinking fund (received) • Fields in Trust consent and legal costs to be met by BRCFC • BRCFC to pay the Council legal costs (£1k) • Price - £1.00 • The public footpath which runs through the property onto Rosewell Road shall be excluded from the transfer and remain in the ownership of the Council who will continue to maintain the path and related public infrastructure and have rights of access over the property for the purpose of maintenance, repair and replacement, as necessary; • Care taker's flat to be transferred as seen – the Council to test for electrical and gas safety and provide the appropriate documentation/certification prior to transfer • Standard conditions to safeguard the property for community use e.g. use restriction and clawback on uplift for alternative non community use • Condition to require the Club maintain sufficient reserves to fund cost of the long-term maintenance, improvement, alteration or replacement of the Astro Turf Pitches. • Such other reasonable terms and conditions as the Executive Director, Place may consider are necessary or expedient to secure the asset transfer within a reasonable time.

Score	Overview of evidence
5, Very strong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance and financial arrangements are strong and sustainable • Best Value characteristics are evidenced throughout the overall approach • Related project benefits are very robust and demonstrate value for money
4, Strong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance and financial arrangements are sound and sustainable • Best Value characteristics are in evidence in the proposal • Related projected benefits are demonstrated well and represent value for money

3, Moderate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance and financial arrangements are in place and acceptable • Best Value characteristics have been considered as part of the proposal • Related projected benefits are acceptable and could lead to value for money
2, Weak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance and financial arrangements are weak • Best Value characteristics are not well demonstrated in the proposal • Related projected benefits are not based on robust information and demonstrate questionable value for money
1, Poor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance and financial arrangements are poor • There is little evidence of Best Value characteristics in the proposal • Related projected benefits are ill defined and/or unrealistic and do not demonstrate value for money